

**RE-NEGOTIATING
ALEVI IDENTITY
VALUES, EMOTIONS
AND CONTENDING VISIONS
ON THE FUTURE**

Talha Köse

Talha Köse is a professor of Political Science and International Relations at Ibn Haldun University. Köse is also the director of SETA Foundation's Brussels office. Dr. Köse completed his doctoral studies at the Institute for Conflict Analysis and Resolution (ICAR) at George Mason University in January 2010. His doctoral research focuses on the transformation of Alevi identity within the post-1980 milieu of Türkiye. Talha Köse worked as a research fellow at the Center for Global Islamic Studies at George Mason University (2010) and served as a visiting lecturer at George Mason University and the University Maastricht (Netherlands). Before joining Ibn Haldun University, Köse worked at İstanbul Şehir University between 2010 and 2017.

Köse has edited and published five books and more than 30 academic articles and book chapters, both in English and Turkish. His scholarly articles have appeared in journals like Foreign Policy Analysis, Party Politics, Negotiation, and Conflict Management Research, the International Journal of Intercultural Relations, Identities: Global Studies in Culture and Power, Middle Eastern Studies, Turkish Studies, Insight Turkey, Perceptions, International Relations, and Türk Kültürü Hacı Bektaş Veli Araştırmaları Dergisi, İnsan & Toplum.

His research interests are on ethnic-sectarian and identity-based conflicts, approaches to inter-cultural reconciliation, community mediation in Türkiye, Alevi and Kurdish issues in Türkiye, and conflict resolution approaches in foreign policy, particularly Turkish foreign policy.

SETA Publications 95

First Published in 2023 by SETA

ISBN: 978-625-8322-42-2

© 2023 SET Vakfı İktisadi İşletmesi

All rights reserved.

No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilized in any form or by any electronic, mechanical or other means, without permission in writing from the publishers.

Editor: Mindy Yartaşı

Cover: Sema Türk Beyazıt

Layout: Said Demirtaş

Printed in Türkiye, İstanbul by Turkuvaz Haberleşme ve Yayıncılık A.Ş.

SETA Publications

Nenehatun Caddesi No: 66 GOP Çankaya 06700 Ankara Türkiye

Tel: +90 312.551 21 00 | Fax : +90 312.551 21 90

www.setav.org | kitap@setav.org

CONTENTS

Acknowledgments	9
CHAPTER 1	
INTRODUCTION	13
Re-Negotiating Alevi Identity: Values, Emotions and Contending Vision on the Future	13
Alevis in the Changing Social and Political Landscape	17
Theoretical Underpinnings of the Study	18
Narratives & Negotiation of Collective Identities	20
Methodological Approach	22
A Note on the Social, Political and Moral Position of the Researcher	25
Chapter Outlines	27
CHAPTER 2	
THE POLITICS OF ALEVI IDENTITY	31
Who are Alevis?	31
Debate on the Ethnic Composition of Alevis	33
The Debate on the Population of Alevis	36
Contextualization of Alevi Identity Negotiation in Türkiye	37
Alevi Community after the 1980 Coup and the Alevi Revival	39
Alevi Identity Politics and the Justice and Development Party's 'Opening' Policies	45
Changing Political Landscape and the Second Opening	49
Stalemate and the Codes of the New Era	52

CHAPTER 3

**PSYCHOCULTURAL DYNAMICS OF ETHNO-SECTARIAN IDENTITIES:
UNDERSTANDING THE EMOTIONAL DIMENSIONS
OF ALEVI IDENTITY REVIVAL IN TÜRKİYE** 55

Introduction	55
Psychocultural Analysis in the Study of Ethno-Religious Identities	60
Sub Genres of Psychocultural Dramas: Narratives on Victimhood	62
Victimhood Narratives, Denial of Identity and Alevi Involvement in Left-Wing Struggle	64
Return of the Repressed: Humiliation and the Turning Points in the Life Stories	66
Complicating the Drama's Archetypes of Evil and Their Followers: <i>The Villains in Alevi Public Narratives</i>	73
Discussions and Conclusion	84

CHAPTER 4

**BETWEEN DIFFERENTIATION AND MARGINALIZATION:
NEGOTIATING THE AXIOLOGICAL BOUNDARIES OF ALEVI IDENTITY** 87

The Alevi revival counters the meta-narrative of the official Turkish National Identity	92
The Changing Landscape of Alevi Moral Narratives	96
From Primordial Ties to Collective Axiology	98
From Marxist and Universalist Political Language to the Incorporation of Cultural Elements and Beliefs	100
Defining Alevilik as a Progressive Ethos	106
Features of the Alevi Collective Axiology	106
Conclusion	113

CHAPTER 5

MORAL QUALITIES OF HEROES AND VILLAINS IN ALEVI POPULAR BELIEFS 115

Myths and History in Drawing the Contours of the Alevi Value System	116
Alevilik as a Belief: Authentic vs Pluralist Positions	119

Alevilik as Turkish Islam: Purity and Nativism in Religious Practice	123
Plurality or Syncretic Tradition	124
<i>Alevi Creed in Defense of Social and Economic Justice</i>	128
Moral Qualities of Alevi Heroes	130
Conclusion	137

CHAPTER 6

**CONTENDING VISIONS ON THE FUTURE OF ALEVI IDENTITY:
UNDERSTANDING THE COMPLEXITY OF THE ALEVI IDENTITY** 139

The Contextualization of the Fragmented Nature of Alevi Identity Negotiation	142
The Religious Position (RP)	145
The Essence of Islam	146
The Politicization of the Alevi Creed	147
The Ideological Position (IP)	150
The Rise of the IP	153
Alevilik as Social and Political Activism	155
The Ethnic Position	158
The Bektāşi Position	162
Post-Alevi Position	171
Conclusion	177

CHAPTER 7

**ALEVI STRUGGLE FOR RECOGNITION AND DIGNITY:
OBSTACLES AND POSSIBLE SOLUTIONS** 179

Psychocultural Barriers to Reconciliation	182
<i>Fear of Assimilation and Problem of Social and Political Discrimination</i>	184
Legal and Political Obstacles	187
Social and Psychocultural Barriers to Reconciliation	194
Is There a Panacea for Dealing with the Alevi/Sunni and Alevi/State Split?	198

BIBLIOGRAPHY 201

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This book is a product of three major research endeavors. The main source of the rich body of personal life stories and broader collective narratives is my doctoral field research. During my doctoral research, I had a chance to do extensive field observations and field visits to various cities in Türkiye. The repertoire of personal narratives of Alevi citizens was collected in Istanbul, Ankara, and Malatya during my field research (2006-2008). The verbatim transcript of personal and collective stories I collected during my doctoral field research constituted more than 2,000 pages. Those narratives and my field notes were critical for understanding the various dynamics of Alevi identity and politics.

I had a chance to understand the rich oral tradition of the Alevi community, and I tried to reflect on how this corpus of personal and collective storylines constituted the mindset of Alevi citizens. I had sincere conversations and exchanges with scores of Alevi community leaders, dedes, young Alevis, Alevi academics, authors, and ordinary citizens. They shared their traumas, critical moments, and turning points in their lives. I am grateful to those who shared their stories and family experiences and sincerely reflected on personal and collective emotions and values. Without the rich cultural resources and psychosocial underpinnings, the reflections on the Alevi identity struggle would sound quite dry and tedious. I would like to thank my research counterparts for their patience and hospitality and for hosting me in their homes, offices, associations, foundations, *cemevis*, and neighborhood cafes.

The second source of research data was collected when we were working on the project titled “Kürt Alevileri ve Çözüm Süreci” (Kurdish Alevi and the Kurdish Peace Process). I had a chance to discuss the reflections of Alevi opinion makers and the Alevi elite, as well as some ordinary Alevi citizens, on the Kurdish Peace Process (Çözüm Süreci- 2013-2015). Reflections and comments on the Kurdish Peace Process were significant in terms of how Alevi citizens came to terms with

the new political reality of decades-long Kurdish issues in Türkiye. The narratives collected during this research were predominantly political. The process of evaluating the Kurdish Peace Process was, at the same time, the comparative assessment of the Alevi identity politics in the Turkish political landscape. The narratives we collected during this process were predominantly political, yet those stories also revealed reflections on the Turkish State, the majority Sunni population, and ethnic Kurds in Türkiye.

The third source of research data was collected during the research project titled “Alevi Identity Demands: Legal and Perceptual Dimensions of the Struggle for Recognition” (2014-2015). The research project constituted four daylong focus group workshops of Alevi dedes, opinion makers, civil society leaders, and intellectuals in Istanbul, Tokat, Malatya, and Erzincan. We had a tedious preparation period for the workshops. Participants of those workshops reflected on legal, political, religious, and cultural aspects of Alevi identity demands.

In addition to the three research projects on Alevi’s collective identity and identity struggle, I also examined the early Alevi popular literature and activist documents and resources. All those resources were very rich symbolically and in terms of activist messages.

Many special individuals contributed to the formation of this book. Kevin Avruch was more than an advisor to me. He kept me on track and helped me immediately whenever I needed his support during my dissertation writing process. At the same time, he was a source of inspiration to me as a distinguished scholar. The engaging ideas and creative interventions of Sara Cobb helped to improve my understanding of some theoretical issues and their practical relevance. Sara was crucial to my interest in studying narratives in conflict research. Daniel Rothbart’s insightful comments were also precious. Nimet Beriker, Richard Rubenstein, Christopher Mitchell, Daniel Druckman, and Recep Şentürk played essential roles in different stages of my academic development. I would like to express my gratitude for their academic mentorship. The International Peace Research Association (IPRA) small research grant was beneficial for conducting my field research. Meridyen Derneği’s small grant also helped me during the final stage of the dissertation writing process. The Turkish Prime Ministry’s grants were crucial in conducting my last two research projects together with a team of researchers. Without SETA Foundation’s infrastructure and professional support, I could have hardly completed the last two research projects.

I should also thank my friends and colleagues Ekrem Karakoç, Cemil Aydın, Burhanettin Duran, Ali Akel, Sencer Ecer, Coşkun Çakır, Nuh Yılmaz, Aziz Turhan, Nur Özkan-Erbay, Nigar Tuğsuz, Ali Yaman, Cary Morrison, and Pamela Creed for their sincere support and collegial solidarity during the various stages of this book. My assistant, Hüsna Kosif, and Ebrar Takış from SETA Foundation helped during the editorial process.

Without the patience and understanding of my wife, Sezen Ceceli-Köse, and my daughter İrem İpek I could have hardly completed this book. I am grateful for their support. Finally, my mother, Nevim Köse, and father, Mehmet Ali Köse, always supported and never left me alone in my academic and intellectual journey.