

New Methodological Perspectives in Islamic Studies

Supplements to Method & Theory in the Study of Religion

Editorial Board

Aaron W. Hughes (*University of Rochester*)
Russell McCutcheon (*University of Alabama*)
Kocku von Stuckrad (*University of Groningen*)

VOLUME 20

The titles published in this series are listed at brill.com/smtr

New Methodological Perspectives in Islamic Studies

Edited by

Abbas Aghdassi
Aaron W. Hughes



BRILL

LEIDEN | BOSTON

Cover illustration: "Man Kneeling While Praying" by Ali Arapoğlu. Available from Pexels
<https://www.pexels.com/photo/photo-of-man-kneeling-while-praying-2652088/> under their license
<https://www.pexels.com/license/>

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Hughes, Aaron W., 1968- editor. | Aghdassi, Abbas, editor.

Title: New methodological perspectives in Islamic studies / edited by Abbas

Aghdassi, Aaron W. Hughes.

Description: Leiden ; Boston : Brill, 2023. | Series: Studies in medieval and reformation traditions, 2214-3270 ; vol. 20 | Includes index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2023006803 (print) | LCCN 2023006804 (ebook) |

ISBN 9789004536623 (hardback) | ISBN 9789004536630 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Islam--Study and teaching. | Islam and politics. | Women in Islam. | Religious life--Islam.

Classification: LCC BP42 .N49 2023 (print) | LCC BP42 (ebook) |

DDC 297.07--dc23/eng/20230222

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2023006803>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2023006804>

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: "Brill". See and download: brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISSN 2214-3270

ISBN 978-90-04-53662-3 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-53663-0 (e-book)

Copyright 2023 by Abbas Aghdassi and Aaron W. Hughes. Published by Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill NV incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Hotei, Brill Schöningh, Brill Fink, Brill mentis, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Böhlau, V&R unipress and Wageningen Academic.

Koninklijke Brill NV reserves the right to protect this publication against unauthorized use. Requests for re-use and/or translations must be addressed to Koninklijke Brill NV via brill.com or copyright.com.

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

Contents

Acknowledgements	VII
List of Tables	VIII
Notes on Contributors	IX
Note on Transliteration	XVI

- 1 Introduction: Moving Beyond 1
Aaron W. Hughes and Abbas Aghdassi
- 2 “Islam and...”: Thinking about Islam through the Act of Comparison 10
Aaron W. Hughes

PART 1

Gender

- 3 Toward a “Hermeneutics of Trust” in the Current Discussion on a Gender-Just Interpretation of Islamic Primary Texts 29
Eva Kepplinger
- 4 The Discursive Construction of Women’s Guile in the Muslim Exegetical Tradition 46
Taira Amin

PART 2

The Political

- 5 Contemporary Turkish Academic Approach to Christianity
The Case of the New Turkish Encyclopedia of Islam (DİA) 75
Betül Avcı
- 6 New Methods for Understanding Political Islam
Tradition-Constituted Rationality and the Theory of the Spirit of Meaning in the Work of Na’ini 94
Ali Abedi Renani and Seyyed Ebrahim Sarparast Sadat
- 7 Recontextualizing Islam in the Social and Collective Memory
Tracing the Sociogenesis of Martyrdom in Türkiye 115
Meral Durmuş and Bahattin Akşit

PART 3

Lived Islams

- 8 Old, New or Digital Philology
Working towards an Amalgamated Work Frame 137
Walid Ghali

- 9 New Lenses for an Ethnography of Islam
The Case of Mevlid Ceremonies 163
Isabella Crespi and Martina Crescenti

- 10 Lived Institutions in the Study of Islam 184
*Brian Arly Jacobsen, Pernille Friis Jensen, Kirstine Sinclair and
Niels Valdemar Vinding*

- 11 Everyday Islam
Moving beyond the Piety and Orthodoxy Divide 213
Magdalena Pycińska

- 12 Moving from a Madrasa Situation to the Process of
Doctrinal Development
An Explication of the Extended Case Method in the Study of Islam 240
Zahraa McDonald

- 13 A Phenomenological Approach to the Study of Lived Islam
and Muslimness 264
Emin Poljarevic

- 14 Back to Critique
Islamic Studies and the Vicious Hermeneutic Circle 291
Abdessamad Belhaj

- Index 307

Acknowledgements

An edited volume does not come into existence without countless hours of group work. This volume is no exception. We, the editors, would like to wholeheartedly thank all the contributors to this volume for their dedication to the idea behind this work, and their patience in various stages of peer-review and production. We would also like to thank the *SMTR* editors, Prof. R.T. McCutcheon and Prof. K. von Stuckrad, who welcomed the volume into their series. Two anonymous reviewers read the manuscript carefully, which benefitted respective chapters and the work as a whole. We appreciate their comments. Rashmi Shetty, associate editor at Brill, was a wonderful help in different stages of this work. We thank her and her team. Also at Brill, we thank Pieter te Velde, who handled the production process quite professionally.

AARON: I thank the usual suspects: my interlocutors (you know who you are), Abbas (my co-editor), and, last but not least, my family.

ABBAS: When I first shared the idea of new methods and methodologies in studying Islam with my co-editor, Prof. A.W. Hughes, I did not know how much his enthusiastic support would help my preliminary idea flourish. We can all see it now. Thank you, indeed, Aaron! I would also like to take this opportunity to thank an exceptional figure, Prof. S.M.K. Sajjadpour, in whose brilliant classes—though in a different field—I had unforgettable memories, and, who remains a source of inspiration for me in perceiving how political psychologies might shape the backstage of methodologies and their possible academic implications. Mr. M.M. Danesh Sokhanvar, also, deserves a special mention for the big role he has played in my life. Very special thanks go to my parents for their sincere daily prayers and good wishes. Finally, I am grateful to my wife, L. Saffari, without whose unique support my scholarly ambitions would have not come true.

Tables

- 4.1 Strategies of representation (based on Wodak 2016, augmented with Toulmin 1979, with examples provided by the analysis) 52–53
- 4.2 List of Sunni and Sufi exegeses used as part of this study 56
- 6.1 Core meanings and institutionalized meaning 111

Notes on Contributors

Ali Abedi Renani

is an Assistant Professor of Political Sciences, at the Research Institute of Culture and Communication, Allameh Tabataba'i University in Iran. He received his master's degree from Imam Sadiq University in 2003. The subject of his thesis was the review of Alasdair McIntyre's criticism on the foundations of liberalism. He received his PhD in Western Political Philosophy from the Australian National University in 2013. The subject of his thesis was MacIntyre's tradition-constituted account of justice and rationality. His research field includes Islamic political thought, ethics, and communitarianism. Recently, his book *Ethics and Politics* was published by Allameh Tabataba'i University Press. Some of his papers include "A Peaceful Interpretation of Jihad in the Qur'an," "Organizational Virtue Ethics," and "McIntyre Moral Theory and Moral Relativism."

Abbas Aghdassi

serves as an Assistant Professor in the Department of History and Civilization of Muslim Societies at the Ferdowsi University of Mashhad (FUM), Iran. He teaches courses on Methods and Methodologies in Islamic Studies, Contemporary Muslim World, and Islam and/in the West. His publications include *Persian Academic Reading* (Routledge, 2018), *Tashayyu' dar Āmrīkā* (Kavīr, 2020), *Perspectives on Academic Persian* (Springer, 2021), and *New Methods in the Study of Islam* (Edinburgh University Press, 2022). He was a visiting research scholar in the Graduate Center (New York, USA). Abbas is the managing editor for *Tārīkh va Farhang*, a journal in Persian on pre-Safavid Iran and Islam. He curates a page with Oxford Bibliographies Online (OBO): *Spotlight in Iranian and Persian Studies*. His fields of interest include methods in Islamic studies, Muslim minorities, academic Persian, bibliography and bibliometrics, (humanizing) Orientalism, and socio-historical study of Greater Khorasan.

Bahattin Akşit

holds the former Dean's Professorship of the Humanities in the Department of Sociology at Maltepe University in Istanbul, where he currently works as an experienced Faculty Member with numerous research and publications on rural and urban sociology, sociology of social change and modernization, sociology of religion and secularization, and sociology of Middle East and Central Asia. He has held positions at the Middle East Technical University/METU (Ankara), Manas University (Bishkek), School of Oriental and African Stud-

ies (University of London) and University of Koç and University of Bogaziçi (Istanbul). While a university student, the rural sociological research he conducted was published as *Underdeveloped Capitalism in Turkey and its Penetration into the Villages* (1967) by the Student Union of METU as a book. He is also the author and/or editor of various national and international publications. Today he actively broadcasts on YouTube (since 2020) and Blogspot (since 2013).

Taira Amin

holds a PhD in Applied Linguistics, Lancaster University. A linguist at heart, trained in the traditional Islamic sciences, her research interests comprise gender construction in Qur'ānic narratives and their reception within the Muslim exegetical tradition, focusing specifically on how exegetes draw upon rhetoric and discourse to support and justify their readings of women-related verses.

Betül Avcı

is an Associate Professor of Religious Studies at Ibn Haldun University (Istanbul, Türkiye). She holds a B.A. from Istanbul University and an M.A. from Marmara University, Istanbul. She received an S.T.L. in interreligious studies from the Pontificia Università Gregoriana in Rome and an M.A. in Islamic studies from the University of Chicago (IL) Divinity School. Her S.T.D. in interreligious studies (2012) is from the Pontificia Università Gregoriana. Her academic research includes comparative theology, Muslim-Christian relations and alternative contemporary spiritualities. She has published several journal articles, book chapters, and encyclopedia entries and has contributed to several international conferences and symposia. She is currently working on an oral history project on her family between the Late Ottoman and Early Republican eras, an edited book on alternative spiritualities in contemporary Turkey as well as a monograph on Muslim-Christian relations.

Abdessamad Belhaj

is senior researcher in Islamic studies at the Research Institute for Religion and Society, Ludovika-University of Public Service (Hungary) and at CISMOC-UCLouvain University (Belgium). He holds a PhD in Islamic Studies (Mohammed V-Rabat, Morocco) and a PhD in Political and Social Sciences (UCLouvain University). He is author of several books such as *Argumentation et dialectique en Islam: Formes et séquences de la munāzara* (Presses Universitaires de Louvain, 2010), *L'autre islam: lumières, liberté et critique* (L'Harmattan, 2021) and *Authority in Contemporary Islam: Structures, Figures and Functions* (Ludovika University Press, 2022).

Martina Crescenti

holds a Ph.D. in Psychology, Communication and Social Sciences at the University of Macerata (Italy) and is currently a research fellow at the University of Torino (Italy) for the national project “Inhabiting uncertainty. A multifaceted study on the relationship between social attitudes and lifestyles in pandemic spaces inhabiting” (PRIN 2022–2025). She is an author of different publications regarding Islam (Turkey, Italy), migration, methodology: Crespi, Crescenti, Scocco *Visual methods and migration: methodological advantages using documentary in the field* (2021), *Visual Studies Journal*; *Giovani musulmani italiani: appartenenza religiosa, socializzazione e agenzie socializzative* (2021), *Culture e Studi sul sociale*, 6 (1), pp. 35–50; *Le cerimonie del mevlid a Bursa e Gemlik. Rito, ruolo, identità* (2016), *Ethnorêma*, Vol. 12, pp. 1–20. She is a member of the European Sociological Association-ESA (RN34-Sociology of Religion, RN10-Sociology of Education).

Isabella Crespi

holds a Ph.D. in Sociology and Methodology and is an Associate Professor in Cultural Sociology at the University of Macerata (Italy). She is the author of many publications regarding cultural aspects. Among them: with Castrén et al. (2021) *The Palgrave Handbook of Family Sociology in Europe* London, Palgrave Macmillan; Crespi, Crescenti, Scocco (2021) *Visual methods and migration: methodological advantages using documentary in the field* in *VISUAL STUDIES*; 37; Abingdon, Oxford, Taylor & Francis; Crespi and Ruspini (2014) *Genere e religioni in Italia. Voci a Confronto* Milano, Francoangeli. She has held visiting positions at the EPFL of Lausanne (CH), Lovaine La Neuve (BEL) and Essex (UK). Since 2017 member of the advisory board of the European Network of Sociology of the Family of which she was the coordinator from 2013 to 2017. She has worked as an expert evaluator for DG Justice of the European Commission (2020) and is included in the expert list of the EIGE (European Institute for Gender Equality) of the European Commission (2020–2025).

Meral Durmuş

holds a Master of Social Science in Sociology (2015) and a Doctor of Philosophy in Sociology (2020), both from Maltepe University. Her main concern has been the sociology of the body, with special interest in Foucauldian body-power relations and modernity, regulation of bodies through power and discipline in modern society, human agency problematic and the social constructionist discourses of identity. Her master's thesis titled *Understanding and giving meaning to nose job through actual personal narratives: Society & rhinoplasty coming nose to nose at the turn of the 21st century* and her doctoral disserta-

tion *Three generations of martyrdom-veteran/ghazi status root paradigm within the cognitive map of 'political-cultural Turkish Islam' society* relate largely to the examination of embodiment through discourse analysis.

Walid Ghali

is an Associate Professor of Arabic and Islamic studies at AKU-ISMC and a specialist in Arabic manuscripts tradition. He also leads the Aga Khan Library in the United Kingdom. His research interest is Sufism and Arabic manuscripts. He published books and articles in English and Arabic with diverse titles. His recent publications are *Islamic and the Middle East Area Studies Librarianship; The Role of Cultural Institutions in Manuscripts Preservation; Humour in Islamic literature and Muslim practices; and Poems in praise of the Prophet (madih) as a citizen of the literary world*. Dr Ghali teaches courses in Sufism, Modern Arabic Literature, and Muslim Reformists. He is a member of the Editorial Board of *Abdou-Filali Ansari Occasional Papers* published by the Institute for the Study of Muslim Civilisations. Dr Ghali is also a Board member of The Islamic Manuscript Association (TIMA).

Aaron W. Hughes

holds the Dean's Professorship of the Humanities and the Philip S. Bernstein Professorship of Jewish Studies in the Department of Religion and Classics at the University of Rochester in New York. He is the author of over twenty books with diverse titles such as *An Anxious Inheritance: Religious Minorities and the Shaping of Sunnī Orthodoxy* (Oxford University Press, 2022), *From Seminary to University: An Institutional History of the Study of Religion in Canada* (University of Toronto Press, 2020), and *Shared Identities: Medieval and Modern Imaginings of Judeo-Islam* (Oxford University Press, 2017). He has held visiting positions at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem, McMaster University (Hamilton, Ontario, Canada), and the Faculty of Oriental Studies at the University of Oxford. His work has been supported by the Social Sciences Research Council of Canada (SSHRC), the Lady Davis Fellowship Trust (Jerusalem), the Killam Foundation, and the National Endowment for the Humanities (NEH).

Brian Arly Jacobsen

is an Associate Professor in Sociology of Religion at the Department of Cross-Cultural and Regional Studies, University of Copenhagen. He holds an M.A. in Sociology of Religion and Minority Studies from the University of Copenhagen (2002) and a PhD from the University of Copenhagen (2009), and he currently leads a cross-disciplinary collective research project on 'Danish Mosques—Significance, Use and Influence' (2017–2022). His field of research is mainly

in the area of religion and politics, religion and local politics, state and religion, civil religion and religious minority groups, especially Muslim minorities in Western Europe, the political debate on Muslim minority groups and Muslim institutions. Among his publications are "Introduction: Operationalizing power in the study of mosques." In *Journal of Muslims in Europe*, co-authored with Niels Valdemar Vinding, Kirstine Sinclair, and Pernille Friis Jensen (2019) and "Religion and State: Complexity in Change." In *Religious Complexity in the Public Sphere: Comparing Nordic Countries*. Inger Furseth (Ed.) co-authored with Lene Kühle, Ulla Schmidt, and Per Petterson (2018).

Pernille Friis Jensen

holds a Ph.D. in Sociology of Religion from Department of Cross Cultural and Regional studies, Copenhagen University. In her PhD thesis; *Women & Gendered Mosque Organisations* (2022, Copenhagen University), Jensen investigated mosques in Denmark as gendered organisations. Her research interests include religion and gender, religious minorities and religious institutions.

Eva Kepplinger

is a postdoc researcher and lecturer at the Department of Islamic-Religious Studies at the Friedrich-Alexander University Erlangen-Nuremberg, Germany. Having discussed the influence of the *maqāṣid* thought of the Andalusian scholar Abū Ishāq al-Shāṭibī on the Maliki school of law in her PhD (publication forthcoming), she currently researches and publishes on Islamic law and ethics in the modern period. Recent publications in this field include the article "Taha Abderrahmane and Abū Ishāq al-Shāṭibī: Comparative Reflections on Legal Thought and Ethics," in: Mohammed Hashas and Mutaz al-Khatib (Eds.): *Islamic Ethics and the Trusteeship Paradigm: Taha Abderrahmane's Philosophy in Comparative Perspectives*, Studies in Islamic Ethics (Brill Book Series), 2020, pp. 62–77.

Zahraa McDonald

is a researcher at JET Education Services in Johannesburg, South Africa. She is a sociologist that has focused on education for the past 15 years. Subsequent to her PhD which examined the intersection of Islamic education and post-secular citizenship she completed post-doctoral fellowships at Stellenbosch University, UCT, CPUT and UJ. Her post-doctoral fellowship at CPUT was with the South African Research Chair in Teacher Education in the Centre for International Teacher Education. She has co-authored a number of journal articles and book chapters exploring teacher development. She has co-edited a book *Learning to teach in post-apartheid South Africa: Student teachers' encounters*

with initial teacher education. She is currently a research associate with the South African Research Chair in Teaching and Learning, UJ as well as with the Centre for International Education at the University of Sussex.

Emin Poljarevic

is currently an Associate Professor of Islamic Studies at SOASCIS, Universiti Brunei Darussalam. He is the author of dozens of scholarly articles and chapters on Islamic activism, Islamic history, Islamophobia, and political theology. He is a co-author of the book, *Social Movements and Civil Wars: When Protests for Democratization Fail* (Routledge, 2017). He holds a position (on leave) in Sociology of Religion position at Uppsala University. He has held positions at Islamic and Middle Eastern Studies at the University of Edinburgh and Stockholm University.

Magdalena Pycińska

is an Assistant Professor at the Institute of the Middle and Far East, Jagiellonian University in Krakow, Poland. She holds a Ph.D. in Cultural Studies. Her research interests include: contemporary national discourses in the Middle East, particularly in Palestine, the Israeli-Palestinian conflict, and social changes in Muslim societies, decolonialism, settler colonialism, racialisation of religion and gender. She attended many international conferences concerning Muslim societies or Palestine in sociological or anthropological perspectives. Selected works include, *Postcolonial Racialisation of Gender and Religious Experience within the Settler Colonial Context: Ahed Tamimi's Experience of a Racialised Practice* ("Literature and Theology" 35: 4, 2021); *Palestinian experiences of shaping the relationship between national politics and Islamic religious tradition* ("Studia Religiosa," 52: 1, 2019).

Seyyed Ebrahim Sarparast Sadat

holds a PhD in Political Sciences. His master's thesis entitled "Tradition and Intellectualism" was awarded in the National Academic Students' Theses Festival. The title of his doctoral dissertation was "The Political Issues of Contemporary Iran and the Issue of Democracy," which was later published as *Iranian Democracy Models* by Allameh Tabataba'i University Press in 2021. His research interest is generally in the field of "Intellectualism," "Tradition," "Democracy," "Political Issues" and "Islamic Political Thought." He has published and presented more than 40 academic papers in academic journals and conferences. Currently, Sarparast Sadat is a faculty member at the Department of Political Sciences, Allameh Tabataba'i University in Iran.

Kirstine Sinclair

is an Associate Professor at the Centre for Modern Middle East and Muslim Studies, University of Southern Denmark, since 2015. She holds an M.A. in History and Comparative Literature from the Universities of Aarhus and Edinburgh (2003) and a PhD from the University of Southern Denmark (2010). Her field of research is Muslim minorities in the West with special reference to religious institutions, organisations and religious-political activism, modernity and mobility. Her most recent publications in English are: "Locating the ideal state: The practice of place by far right and Islamist parties" in *Journal of Intercultural Studies*, co-authored with Susan De Groot Heupner (2022), "What Does It Mean to be Danish? The Integration of Muslims in Denmark in a Historical Perspective" in *Journal of International Migration and Integration* (2022) and *Muslim Subjectivities in Global Modernity Islamic Traditions and the Construction of Modern Muslim Identities*, co-edited with Dietrich Jung, Brill (2020).

Niels Valdemar Vinding

is an Associate Professor at the Faculty of Theology, University of Copenhagen. He holds a B.A. in Theology (UCph, 2006), a M.A. in Islamic Studies (UCph, 2009), a PhD in Islamic Studies (UCph, 2013) and a LL.M. in Canon Law (Cardiff U, 2020). His field of research is on Islam and Muslims in Denmark and Europe in the context of church and state, and he currently leads a cross-disciplinary collective research project on 'Producing Sharia in Context' (2021–2024). His most recent publications include *Annotated Legal Documents on Islam in Europe: Denmark* (Brill 2020), "In what sense is Islamic religious law legally recognised in Denmark?" in the *Nordic Journal of Law and Social Research* (2021), and "An American Example of Islamic Chaplaincy Education for the European Context." Special Issue on Exploring New Assemblages of Islamic Higher Education in Western Europe, *Religions Vol. 12*, no. 6, 2021.

Note on Transliteration

This volume follows the transliteration guidelines of *IJMES* for Arabic, Persian and Turkish terms. Although the *Encyclopaedia of Islam* and the *Encyclopaedia Iranica* provide more accurate systems of transliteration and transcription for Arabic and Persian languages accordingly, *IJMES* remains a more accessible and user-friendly system to both authors and readers—regardless of some of its technical shortcomings for publishing and indexing services. For all other local languages, the transliterations are those of the LOC.