A Historical Approach to Sustainability in Management

Sümeyye Kuşakcı

Abstract

Even though sustainability as a modern phenomenon has its roots in 1970s, there exist historical texts directly or indirectly addressing managerial sustainability. Among these texts, books of advice deserve a particular interest because of their relevance to the field of management. Kutadgu Bilig is an advice text written by Yusuf Khass Hajib of Balasagun in 1070 and presented to the reigning prince of Kashghar. It has been accepted as "the oldest monument of Islamic Turkish literature". According to Yusuf the key to a sustainable management is justice: "And if you desire everlasting kingdom, then do justice and remove injustice from the people".This study aims to show the relevance of justice to discussions around the concept of sustainable development, specifically sustainability in management. Our work initially analyzes the concept of justice from Western and Islamic perspectives, and secondly reviews discourses of Yusuf in the matter of justice. Lastly, it is attempted to derive concrete implications for a sustainable management from Yusuf's approach to justice.

Key Words: Kutadgu Bilig, justice, sustainable development, corporate sustainability

Introduction

While sustainability could be lexically defined as the ability to be maintained at a certain rate or level, development refers elimination of inequality, poverty, and unemployment in a society.

The concept of sustainability has emerged as a modern phenomenon, when International Union for the Conservation of Nature (IUCN) adopted a new mandate in 1969. In 1972 it came to the fore in the United Nations Conference on the Human Environment in Stockholm. Initially sustainable development made a mention of possibility and vitality of economic growth without environmental damage. The notion has been discussed and developed continuously in various international platforms such as World Conservation Strategy in 1980, the Brundtland Report in 1987, and United Nations Conference on Environment and Development in Rio in 1992. Moreover negotiations around sustainability created also a tremendous impact at national governments' and businesses' level (Keiner, 2006).

Brundtland Commission (1987) formally known as World Commission on Environment and Development offers the most comprehensive definition of sustainable development: "Sustainable development is development that meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs".

The commission has not been merely focused on environmental facet of sustainable development, however has brought up social and economic pillars of sustainability to the agenda: "In essence, sustainable development is a process of change in which the exploitation of resources, the direction of investments, the orientation of technological development; and institutional change are all in harmony and enhance both current and future potential to meet human needs and aspirations" (Brundtland, 1987).

When considered this point of view sustainable development embraces debates around ethical code of conduct not only in political but also in business arena; international and national laws and regulations adopting the principle of sustainability; personal lifestyles and consumerism.

In spite of such emphasize on a comprehensive understanding of sustainability at theoretical level, much of the discussions around sustainability has focused purely on the environmental aspect. However, business world encountering significant social, technological, cultural, economic and environmental challenges requires a deeper understanding, an objective analysis, and a careful implementation of the concept of sustainable development.

"For the business enterprise, sustainable development means adopting business strategies and activities that meet the needs of the enterprise and its stakeholders today while protecting, sustaining and enhancing the human and natural resources that will be needed in the future" (IISD, 1992).

Even though sustainability as a modern phenomenon has its roots in 1970s, there exist historical texts directly or indirectly addressing sustainability from various perspectives. Among these texts, books of advice deserve a particular interest because of their relevance to the field of management.

Kutadgu Bilig is an advice text written by Yusuf Khass Hajib of Balasagun in 1070 and presented to the reigning prince of Kashghar. It has been accepted as "the oldest monument of Islamic Turkish literature". According to Yusuf the key to a sustainable management is justice: "And if you desire everlasting kingdom, then do justice and remove injustice from the people".

This study aims to show the relevance of justice to discussions around the concept of sustainable development, specifically sustainability in management. Our work initially analyzes the concept of justice from western and Islamic perspectives, and secondly reviews discourses of Yusuf in the matter of justice. Lastly, it is attempted to derive concrete implications for sustainable management from Yusuf's approach to justice.

Corporate sustainability

Throughout history mankind had principally pursued basic principles in order

to maintain agricultural, fiscal and social sustainability. To put it all in simple terms, these practices were centuries long traditions, not sustainability efforts. By the time homo economicus appeared with an inevitable intention of profit-maximization, rules of the game have drastically changed. The world was riding at full speed to final destination and we launched the concept of sustainability as if it was totally brand-new.

Starting from a new mandate adopted by International Union for the Conservation of Nature (IUCN) in 1962 and the United Nations Conference on the Human Environment in 1972, the concept have been discussed in several occasions such as World Conservation Strategy in 1980, the Brundtland Report in 1987, and United Nations Conference on Environment and Development in Rio in 1992.

Brundtland Commission (1987) integrated environmental, social, and economic facets of sustainability and developed the most-known definition of sustainable development: "Sustainable development is development that meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs".

In spite of such emphasize on a comprehensive understanding of sustainability at theoretical level, much of the discussions around sustainability has focused purely on the environmental aspect. However, "in the course of the 1990s, the scope of sustainable development was both broadened and deepened" (Steurer et al., 2005) .

While economic and social issues were initially addressed only as far as they were perceived to be relevant for environmental concerns, they evolved into equally important dimensions for sustainable development. On the other hand, application of sustainable development at corporate level was called as corporate sustainability. In other words, corporate sustainability aimed to make organizations future-proof (Wales, 2013).

"While sustainable development is commonly perceived as societal guiding model, which addresses a broad range of quality of life issues in the long term, corporate sustainability is a corporate guiding model, addressing the short- and long-term economic, social and environmental performance of corporations" (Steurer et al., 2005).

Another sustainability-related concept in the literature is Corporate Social Responsibility. According to Papaoikonomou and Seto-Pamies (2016), sustainability is "the latest manifestation of what was previously referred to as Corporate Social Responsibility". Corporate sustainability and CSR both aims to create a balance between economic, social and environmental responsibilities of a corporation. However corporate sustainability is broader than CSR in terms of its scope (Steurer et al., 2005). According to Garavan and McGuire (2010), CSR operates with in concordance with existing management paradigms describing main motive of a business organization as profit; corporate sustainability envisions a revolution pursuing economic prosperity through value creation for all.

"A corporate sustainability orientation has an inherently ethical dimension" (Guerci et al., 2015). Principally sustainability attempts to direct executives and employees to a better understanding and implementation of ethical code of conduct. As Pearce at al. (2006) underlined, unethical leadership practices lead employees to anti-sustainable activities. Besides, Florea at al. (2013) propose that corporate sustainability is dependent on not only human resources practices of organization but also employees and their values. Gladwin et al. (1995) developed a concept called sustaincentrism and deduced the most commonly mentioned components of sustainable development through content analysis: inclusiveness, connectivity, equity, prudence, and security. "Inclusiveness implies human development over time and space. Connectivity entails an embrace of ecological, social, and economic interdependence. Equity suggests inter- generational, intra-generational, and interspecies fairness. Prudence connotes duties of care and prevention: technologically, scientifically, and politically. Security demands safety from chronic threats and protection from harmful disruption".

The promising reality is that day by day more people awaken from the dream of endless profit maximization. Enterprises perceive the importance of ethical conduct or corporate social responsibility as a mean of sustainable development. Businesses are increasingly evaluated based not only on their financial success but also on their positive impact on society (İyigün, 2014).

Methodology

As might be expected, applying a proper research method for any inquiry is crucial for a successful study. "A research design describes a (flexible) set of assumptions and considerations leading to specific contextualized guidelines that connect theoretical notion and elements to dedicated strategy of inquiry supported by methods and techniques for collecting empirical material" (Jonker & Pennink, 2010).

Our research aiming to discuss justice as key to the sustainability in management within the context of Kutadgu Bilig grasps reality "from the inside out". Namely it attempts to explore some facts within a specific context utilizing inductive reasoning. In that case it is a qualitative research.

On the level of methodology, taxonomy tree of qualitative strategies introduced by Walcott (1992) is exploited. Among almost two dozens of strategies, he identified "archival strategies" as a major category "not only in deference to the dominant research activity of biographers, historians, and philosophers but also to acknowledge that virtually all field workers make use of materials prepared by others". Content Analysis which is a type of archival strategy is selected as methodology of our research.

Berelson (as cited in Cho & Lee, 2014) defined the content analysis as a research technique for the objective, systematic, and quantitative description in the manifest content of communication. In order to achieve results intended with our work; instead of observation or interview, directly siyasatnama texts, reference books and scientific papers were used. In an attempt to present the background of the research, it might be functional to classify texts investigated at three levels.

[1] First level involving texts dealing with politics, political history, history of economic and management thought, and philosophy, is targeting to establish a well-supported foundation.

[2] Second level includes "books of advice" in the widest sense and specifically advice texts produced during the Golden Age of Islamic civilization.

[3] At the last level, there is Kutadgu Bilig selected for a more extensive examination.

The qualitative content analysis starts with data collection and follows a set of systematic procedures in order to secure the validity and reliability of findings. Data preparation in our case refers selection of Kutadgu Bilig among so many advice texts for a deeper investigation. "While quantitative content analysis uses the physical linguistic units such as words, sentences, or paragraphs as the unit for analysis; qualitative content analysis use individual themes which might be expressed in a single word, a phrase, a sentence, a paragraph, or an entire document"

(Wildemuth & Zhang, 2009). So the unit of analysis in our case might be a text of any size indicating any attribute relevant for successful leadership. Categories and coding schema were developed inductively based on the raw data namely Kutadgu Bilig without taking the previous related studies or theories in consideration. After the coding scheme attained was tested on a sample, texts were entirely coded. Assessment of coding consistency was provided by the use of a second-coder. The most crucial step of analysis requiring strong reasoning abilities includes exploring justice-based implications for a more sustainable management. Lastly the methodology and findings were reported within this study.

Books of advice

During the course of history, almost all civilizations contributed to the genre of 'book of advice' with different labels; such as 'sbyt', 'astra', 'andarz', 'mirror for prince' and 'siyasatnama'. They specifically aimed to synthesize the reality of politics with moral principles. The form used was also wide-ranging: prose, poetic, or fable.

As a matter of fact, the books of advice principally address a ruler governing a state which is basically a public organization. The management of a public organization is expected to be unlike management of a business organization. The crucial question at that point could be how significantly the public administration differs from the business administration.

D'Andrade (2012) states, "large modern corporations have much in common with many modern political entities. These corporations are quite powerful, are the focus of many of its citizens' lives, even have their own independent policies; and on one view of competition, they are also continually at war". Besides, Jay (cited in Calhoon, 1969) argues that "a corporation is not something different from a state with some interesting similarities; it is a state with few unimportant differences."

Despite the fact that the genre introduced in this work was principally written for a statesman, they contain a great deal of universal advice applicable to any management context. In the recent decades in a way supporting the previous argument, scholars intensively utilized the heritage of books of advice in various field of management.

In Islamic World, the name of the genre discussed in our work is 'siyasatnama', which means 'book of government'. The word 'siyasa' has an Arabic origin and literally refers to the training of a horse. It means also the governance of a state, the art of management, penalty and execution. In the narrowest sense, it could be described to maintain the order and safety of a society by using ethical means through the disciplining and instructing them to the 'good'(Atmaca, no date). The suffix '-nama' which has a Persian origin, means book or treatise. The term 'siyasatnama' reflects as well multicolored structure of Islamic civilization; with its partly Persian, partly Arabic origin.

Islam, as a major world religion, showed up in Arabia in the 7th century. Not only 'Quran', the sacred scriptures of Islam, but also 'Hadith', a collection of sayings attributed to the Prophet, involve various advices addressing anyone who dominates over the people. The coverage is broad in scope, from justice, modesty and advisement to corruption.

After migrating to Medina, the Prophet Muhammed established the first community-state of Islam. Islam was attempting to regulate both relationships to God and to others contacted in social life. Because of its comprehensive approach to the human life, Muslims constructed not only religious rules and institutions but also laws and institutions governing a society (Mahdi,

Rahman and Schimmel, 2012). If we look from this perspective, it is not surprising that there are a myriad of advice texts addressing governors.

Initially advices had been in the form of epistle or testament counseling recipient basic principles of administration briefly. In the course of time, Islam pervaded Iran, Middle Asia, South Africa and Anatolia. It came across with various cultures and attempted to harmonize all. Later and 'right' examples of siyasatnama were written in the form of bulky book.

Kutadgu Bilig

"Kutadgu Bilig", "the oldest monument of Islamic Turkish literature", was written by Yusuf Khass Hajib of Balasagun in 1070 and presented to the reigning prince of Kashghar. It was written in Karakhanid, or Middle Turkish which was at the same time the language of the Orkhon inscriptions and verbally means "the wisdom which brings happiness". Kutadgu Bilig, a long didactic poem consisting of more than 6,500 couplets, is considered as unique among advice texts with its unexampled style: a narrative unfolding between four principal characters who are "Kun Togdi", "Ay Toldi", "Ogdtilmis", and "Odgurmil". However, the substance of the book is analogous with other texts: how a ruler should govern, how he should treat the various classes of society, which types of qualities are required for various positions. Kun Togdi, meaning "Rising Sun", is the king and represents "Justice"; Ay Toldi, meaning "Full Moon" is the vizier and represents "Fortune"; Ogdtilmis, meaning "Highly Praised" is the son of Full Moon and represents "Intellect" or "Wisdom"; and Odgurmil, meaning "Wide Awake" is an ascetic and represents "Man's Last End". The book allegorically argues that "justice", to be exercised properly, requires the help of "Fortune", "Wisdom", and "The End," or what we might call "Religion" (Deverux, 1985).

According to Aksan[1](1993), Kutadgu Bilig is among the most influential examples of the genre. It was written in the beginning of the Golden Age of Islam and spread over to the wide geographical areas. It was still the ones most frequently cited during the late Ottoman times. According to Dankoff [2](Yusuf Khass Hajib, 1983), Kutadgu Bilig as one of the earliest examples of the genre is "arguably superior to the rest in its breadth of visions, its originality of form, and its literary quality."

Author of the book: Yusuf Khass Hajib

Yusuf Khass Hajib has been accepted as the first poet and thinker of Turkish Islamic civilization. In spite of particular importance of Karakhanid Era he lived in for the Turkish history as a transition phase, the time period remained a puzzle which has not been properly investigated yet.

The Karakhanids were - besides the Ghaznavids and the Seljuks - one of the three Turkish dynasties dominating the Islamic lands by the eleventh century. They strived to improve Turkish language and Turkish script unlike the Ghaznavids

---

[1] Virginia Aksan is a prominent historian focused on the eighteenth and early nineteenth century Ottoman history, and an academician teaching courses in Islamic, Middle Eastern and most recently Mediterranean history.

[2] Robert Dankoff is an academician in the fields of Turkology and Islam in Chicago University. He specialized in linguistic and literary subjects in Ottoman Turkish texts and also in early Turkish Islamic manuscripts.

and the Seljuks promoting Iranian culture (Yusuf Khass Hajib, 1983).

Limited amount of information pertaining to Yusuf Khass Hajib is indeed what was deduced from three manuscripts of Kutadgu Bilig. His name is mentioned only once along 6645 verses. On the verse 6627, it came to be known that the name of the author is Yusuf: "Yusuf! Utter words essential and true, and conceal what is unnecessary lest it cause harm".

His exact date of birth is also not known. He says on the verse 6623 that he completed the book in 462. At that time his sixties were waiting for him. So he might have been born around 1019. According to prologues, built into the text by scriptwriters after a century; the author is from Balasagun, which was called as QuzOrdu by the Turks at that time. It was a town of mediaeval central Asia, specifically located in the valley of the Chuy which is now within the borders of Kyrgyz Republic. There still exists a minaret called "Burana" and a few large tombs which are accepted as Karakhanid inheritance (Bosworth, 2013).

From the text it is derived that he belonged to an aristocrat family, and had a serious education covering prevalent sciences of the time, arts and literature. The text itself committed to paper in aruz prosody is indicative of his brilliant mastery of Turkish written language. He had also a good command of Arabic and Persian. Nevertheless he preferred to write his book in Turkish, in his mother tongue, which definitely could not be ascribed to personal, but national motives (cited in Acindi n.d.). Besides he possessed an incredible comprehension of Islamic sciences as could be observed from the fact that he was able to integrate Turkish tradition into the Islamic frame. He started to write his book in his hometown, Balasaghun. It took eighteen months to finish the book. Yusuf finished his book in Kashghar and presented it to Tavghach Bughra Khan. He was remunerated with the position of Khass Hajib, which can be translated as "Privy Chamberlain" (Yusuf Khass Hajib, 1983). He spent his life in two prominent centers of the Karakhanids: Balasaghun and Kasghar. While Balasaghun was the capital of Karakhanid Empire, Kasghar which is another prominent center of population was a religious and cultural metropolis. Taking into consideration the intense relationship between Kasghar and Baghdad, it becomes evident why initial masterpieces of Turkish Islamic literature emerged in Kasghar. Besides it seems conceivable that Yusuf had benefited from leading scientists and poets of his time such as Al-Biruni, Ibn Sina, Ferdowsi and Omar Khayyam (cited in Acindi n.d.).

Structure and content of the book

Yusuf introduces his book with the following verse (verse: 350): "I have named the book "Kutadgu Bilig", may it bring Fortune to the reader and guide his way". It is unanimously accepted that "bilig" was used for such treatise on wisdom in Middle Turkish. However, the meaning of "kutadgu" which is the other half of the title remained controversial among researchers. The stem of the word "kut" was translated as "fortune" or "the charisma of rule". According to Dankoff, "Kutadgu Bilig" means "The Wisdom that Conduces to Royal Glory or Fortune" (Yusuf Khass Hajib, 1983).

After presenting his book, he also declares his main intention in composing such advice text on the verses 351-352: "I have uttered my discourse and composed my book. It will be a true guide, that you may grasp both the worlds and be blessed with Fortune". Dankoff (Yusuf Khass Hajib, 1983) verbalizes Yusuf's mission - within the context of political and cultural circumstances of Karakhanid Empire - in his introduction to the English translation of Kutadgu Bilig:

> "Yusuf's intent was to provide his patron a mirror of court life, in order to guide his conduct in an age full of opportunity and uncertainty, and thus to ensure the success of his rule."

According to Dankoff (Yusuf Khass Hajib, 1983), Kutadgu Bilig can be studied in two main parts. The first part of the book ending on the verse 3120 is a traditional mirror for princes. The dialogues between the king and Highly Praised describes us qualities and duties of courtly officers such as vizier, commander, chamberlain, gatekeeper, envoy, secretary, treasure, cook and cupbearer. Obligations of the king towards his subject and obligations of subject towards their ruler are also explained.

After the verse 3120, the text changes direction and discusses "the conflict between the political ideals of the community and the religious conscience of the individual" (Yusūf Khāṣṣ Ḥājib, 1983) visualized by means of dialogues between Highly Praised and Wide Awake.

The plot of the story could be summarized as follows: Full Moon successfully serves the King and dies. The son of Full Moon, Highly Praised, relieves guard and becomes the King's most loyal servant. The King, who is pertinaciously aspiring after the Justice, also requires the counsel of Wide Awake. However, Wide Awake, attempting to keep himself away from worldly concerns, returns the request. At the end, he also dies leaving the King and Highly Praised unassisted. It should not be forgotten that even Wide Awake wins the debate; Highly Praised is the hero of the whole story. On the allegorical level, Yusuf's story could be interpreted as follows (Yusuf Khass Hajib, 1983): "Justice, to be exercised properly, requires Fortune, Wisdom, and the end what we might call Religion".

As Arat (Yusuf Has Hacip, 2008) emphasized in his introduction to Turkish translation of the book, Kutadgu Bilig could shed light on studies of not only Turkish literature but also Turkish cultural and political history. Moreover, the book includes challenging inspirations of thousand years old for ones who are in quest of clearing up millennium's acute problems in various fields.

Justice

The root of the word of, "jus" means "right" or "law". According to Oxford Dictionary, a just person is someone "doing what is morally right and giving everyone his or her due".

"Justice" is not only a moral but also political concept which refers on one hand a virtue of character and on the other hand a quality of society. As early as the ancient communities, the main aim of a government has been to provide and secure the justice. In other saying, justice is accepted as the primary link between the community and the leader (Kriger & Seng, 2005).

Before highlighting how Kutadgu Bilig discusses the concept of justice, it would be worthwhile to analyze and differentiate the term "justice" from Islamic and Western points of view. Islamic understanding of justice is relevant for our study, because two advice texts under researched have Islamic origins. Besides western insight into the justice is also relevant, because modern leadership studies have been developing based on western worldview.

Pomerleau (2013) summarizes the western history of "justice" as following:

> "Western philosophers generally regard justice as the most fundamental of all virtues for ordering interpersonal relations and establishing and maintaining a stable political society. For Plato, justice is a virtue establishing rational order, with each part performing its appropriate role and not interfering with the proper

functioning of other parts. Aristotle says justice consists in what is lawful and fair, with fairness involving equitable distributions and the correction of what is inequitable. For Augustine, the cardinal virtue of justice requires that we try to give all people their due; for Aquinas, justice is that rational mean between opposite sorts of injustice, involving proportional distributions and reciprocal transactions. Hobbes believed justice is an artificial virtue, necessary for civil society, a function of the voluntary agreements of the social contract; for Hume, justice essentially serves public utility by protecting property (broadly understood). For Kant, it is a virtue whereby we respect others' freedom, autonomy, and dignity by not interfering with their voluntary actions, so long as those do not violate others' rights; Mill said justice is a collective name for the most important social utilities, which are conducive to fostering and protecting human liberty. Rawls analyzed justice in terms of maximum equal liberty regarding basic rights and duties for all members of society, with socio-economic inequalities requiring moral justification in terms of equal opportunity and beneficial results for all; and various post-Rawlsian philosophers develop alternative conceptions."

Even though, at the level of philosophy it is highly possible to observe uniformity down the ages; starting from the fourteenth century the concept of justice became a principal debate issue of social and political order. Deeply transforming commercial and industrial conditions pushed mediaeval western world to question the importance and limits of justice. Besides well-known advice of Jesus "give to Caesar what belongs to Caesar and to God what belongs to God!" supported a separation between the sacred and secular fields of daily life (Iqbal & Lewis, 2009).

"Adl" is Arabic equivalent of "justice" and appears as focal point of Islamic ethics and politics. Even though in practice it is mainly associated with religious law, justice is beyond religion. The meaning of "adl" is "to straighten", "setting in order", and "fixing in the right place".

Not only "Quran", the sacred scriptures of Islam, but also "Hadith", a collection of sayings attributed to the Prophet, discuss justice as one of the main themes of not only human interrelations but also governmental procedures.

Ali Ibn Abi Talib, the last Rightly-Guided Caliph, writes an epistle to his fellow Malik al-Ashtar, whom he had appointed governor of Egypt. While he outlines qualifications and responsibilities of a governor, he advices sagaciously to maintain justice and being humble to the people (Ali İbn-i EbiTalib, 1997).

"The second teacher" after Aristotle "the first one", Abu Nasr Muhammad ibn Muhammad Farabi, argues that the virtuous city united by love, controlled and maintained by justice, which followed upon love (Syed, no date).

According to al-Ghazali who is a prominent thinker of eleventh century, governments' responsibility of top priority is to bring prosperity to subjects through justice (Gazali, no date).

Ibn Taymiyya, who was a theologian and religious jurist, discusses the importance of justice with these words (İbn Teymiye, 1999):

"God upholds the just state even if it is unbelieving, but does not uphold the unjust state even if it is believing,' and that, 'the world can survive with justice and unbelief, but not with injustice and Islam."

Tyan (2013) summarizes development of the concept of justice at a continuum from al-Mawardi to Ottomans in this manner:

In al-Māwardī's definition, 'adāla, the quality of 'adl, is described as a state of moral and religious perfection. For Ibn Rushd it consists in not committing major sins, and also avoiding minor ones. But another author observes that such a state can be found only very exceptionally, in the saints; that 'adāla simply describes the state of a person who in general obeys the moral

and religious law. This last conception is the one that came to be finally accepted. In the latest stage of Muslim law, as it appears in the codification undertaken in the Ottoman Empire about the middle of the 19th century, the following definition is given: "The 'adl person is one in whom good impulses prevail over bad". In short, one can translate 'adl by "person of good morals", with the essentially religious sense that this has in Islam. Whether this quality must be a natural inclination, innate or acquired, or whether it is sufficient for it to be achieved by an effort of will, is however a theoretically disputed point"

According to the leading Muslim scholar of twentieth century Fazl-ur Rahman, Islamic monotheism is organically linked to the idea of justice. He states that "in the absence of seeking the general welfare of men, worship of God— even of one God— is not only meaningless but sheer hypocrisy" (cited in Kriger & Seng, 2005).

Iqbal and Lewis (2009) summarizes the whole story as following:

Justice as the precondition for preserving peace, equilibrium, and harmony on earth, characteristics which are essential in their own right as well as to enable humankind to understand the demands of their position as the trustees of God on earth.

At that point it is coming in sight how Islamic understanding of justice is differentiating from western version of justice. First of all, the separation of sacred and secular sides of life is unthinkable. That is why after migrating to Medina; the Prophet Muhammed established the first community-state of Islam. Islam attempts to regulate both relationships to God and to others contacted in social life. Because of its comprehensive approach to the human life, Muslims constructed not only religious rules and institutions but also laws and institutions governing a society (Mahdi, Rahman & Schimmel, 2012). Secondly; while modern-days' justice is based on "humanist principles or documents such as the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, the Islamic position is rooted in the metaphysical and the responsibilities of adherents as the trustees of God on earth" (Iqbal & Lewis, 2009). What makes the concept of "justice" so complicated is also the transformation of the extent of the word from classical times to today (Slote, 2010):

Plato in the Republic treats justice as an overarching virtue of individuals (and of societies), meaning that almost every issue he (or we) would regard as ethical comes in under the notion of justice. But in modern usages justice covers only part of individual morality, and we don't readily think of someone as unjust if they lie or neglect their children--other epithets more readily spring to mind. What individual justice most naturally refers to are moral issues having to do with goods or property.

For instance, also in Turkish language "adalet" is defined besides "giving everyone his or her due" as "doğruluk" meaning uprightness. However, if every day usage is considered, there exist a slight difference between "adalet" and "doğruluk".

Justice in Kutadgu Bilig

It must be underlined that consideration of justice as a crucial step of managerial sustainability exists in almost all advice texts produced by Islamic civilization. Great vizier Nizam al-Mulk (1960) states in very beginning of his treatise called Siyasat-Nama an Arabic proverb; "a kingdom may list while there is irreligion, but it will not endure when there is oppression".

Ibn Taymiyya (1999), a theologian and religious jurist, discussed the importance of justice in his book dealing with public and private law in Islam :

God upholds the just state even if it is unbelieving,

but does not uphold the unjust state even if it is be-lieving,' and that, 'the world can survive with justice and unbelief, but not with injustice and Islam.

However; our study aims to show the relevance of books of advice to managerial sustainability by the use of a single selected text namely Kutadgu Bilig. In that case we can proceed with the concept of justice within the scope of Kutadgu Bilig.

According to Yusuf the key to a sustainable management is before anything else justice: "And if you desire everlasting kingdom, then do justice and remove injustice from the people". Kutadgu Bilig also discusses the importance of justice for a ruler profoundly. According to Yusuf, (Verse: 2030-2036).

> As for the one who is unjust, he cannot enjoy his rule, nor can the people bear his injustice. A wise man has said that unjust rulers never rule for long. Injustice is a blazing fire which burns whatever it comes near and justice is water that brings forth blessing whatever it flows. The prince who desires to enjoy a long rule must promote justice and protect his people. With justice the territory will increase and the realm will thrive; with injustice the territory will diminish and the realm will fail to ruin. Many a royal court has been ruined by an unjust ruler, who himself grew weak and died of hunger in the end. As long as a prince keeps a steadfast heart and promotes justice, his rule will not collapse but long will stand upright.

He emphasizes justice as one of the two main bonds which hold the state together (Verses: 2015-2018):

> There are two bonds which hold the state together. One is wakefulness; the other is justice, the root of government. If the prince is wakeful, he keeps guard over his realm and cruches the foe's neck and tramples upon him. And if the prince dispenses justice, he keeps his realm in good order and causes its sun to shine. These are the two bonds of rulership: as long as they are perfect, princely state endures.

He does not perceive it enough to mention the necessity of justice for a state and makes a backward deduction by signalizing destruction caused by injustice (Verses: 2023-2024):

> There are two things which undermine princely rule, and cause the ruler to stray from the straight path. One is injustice, the other is negligence. With these two the prince may ruin his realm.

According to Yusuf, oppressor will be disgraced in both worlds. An oppressor ruler not only endangers the sustainability of the state, but also will be punished in afterlife (Verses: 1283-1284):

> Do not throw yourself in the Fire for the sake of this world. Do not opress people or appropriate their goods.

On the contrary, permanent virtuous behaviours are expected from a ruler. In this manner he could win the confidence and love of his followers (Verse: 1367):

> Pratice virtue in place of oppression and violence. Strive with hand and tongue to make the people love you.

As it is stated in the definition of justice, a just man is someone who is giving everyone his or her due. Carefully considered this aspect of justice requires a clear understanding of reality and even sagacity. Yusuf successfully propounds it as a prerequisite of being a great ruler (Verses: 5885):

> If a man failed to distinguish good from bad and straight from crooked, how could he become a great ruler and a powerful prince?

Justice is a sine qua non for any level of administration. A just ruler is also liable to assign just officers starting from the position of viziership (Verse: 2208):

> He ought to be handsome of face, and well-kempt in appearance, while in manner he must be straightforward and also genial. Thus he will pay the people their due,

and provide them benefit for many a month and year.

Establishing justice in a country decidedly gets start through establishing justice at home (Verse: 4527-4530):

> Again, treat your servants and underlings well. Give them enough to eat, and make up what is deficient in their dress. Task them only according to their strength, do not give them too much hardship to bear. God will make you answer for your treatment of them, He will be their adversary against you. They too are God's servants. So do not oppress them, or you will have hell to pay.

He many times reexpresses inevitability of justice with the intention of maintaining sustainability in management. This is at the sime time what God commands him as an administrator (Verses: 1450-1451):

> If you would maintain for long your princely station, O King, there are certain things you must do and others you must avoid doing. Strive to do justice and to avoid injustice – in this way you serve God and embrace His gate.

Coding process of our research and constant comparison of texts in different languages revealed an interesting detail. Robert Dankoff (Yusuf Khass Hajib, 1983), in his translation which has been evaluated well-done in literary and linguistic senses, uses the words justice and law interchangeably. That is partly because of that Yusuf counsels law, as opposite of injustice. For example, in verse 2032, the word "törü" meaning "law" was translated by Dankoff as "justice":

> Injustice is a blazing fire which burns whatever it comes near. And justice is water that brings forth blessing whatever it flows.

The same situation encounters us in verse 454:

> "A good thing is princely rule, but better even is justice, whom the prince must put into effect".

To sum up, according to texts, justice is the most fundamental requirement of a political order, not religiosity. However, what determines the just and unjust one is law legislated based on religion.

Justice-based implications for a sustainable management

It is considerably purposeful to derive from Kutadgu Bilig concrete justice-based principles targeting sustainable management:

[1] Key to the success in managerial sustainability efforts as in all other fields of the life is unconditionally maintaining justice.

[2] Oppression at any level of the organization causes management to fail. Leadership should internally and externally secure the justice in every detail. A comprehensive approach to the justice should be maintained. Leaders need to know transparently right from wrong and to listen to the voice of inner conscience.

[3] This is an uncontroversial fact that for an entirely just organization employees at all level should embrace same principles. Justice must be acknowledged by employees not only as an organizational policy, but also as a personal value.

[4] Leader should serve as a role model by setting a high value on justice. It should not be forgotten that a fish rots from the head down or vice versa. Foul water makes nothing but soiled.

[5] "Human" factor is another crucial component of management process. A conscious leader aims to satisfy "human" which includes not only employee of the organization but also customers, in order to ride high his business.

[6] Any delay in implementation of justice is non-excusable. Justice must be secured at once and should be implemented al-

most immediately.

[7] Justice manifests itself at three critical points: heart, tongue, and behavior. Leader should believe in justice whole-heartedly, support his belief through what he says, and demon-strate all by his behaviors.

Conclusion

Even though sustainability as a modern phenomenon has its roots in 1970s, there exist historical texts directly or indirectly addressing managerial sustainability. Among these texts, books of advice deserve a particular interest because of their relevance to the field of management.

Yusuf Khass Hajib collected his approach to governance into a book called "Kutadgu Bilig". He lived in the early eleventh century and aimed to develop a framework bringing the real-ity of politics and moral principles close together. His teach-ings and experiences had enormously influenced the concept of public administration in Turkish Islamic tradition. According to Yusuf the key to a sustainable management is justice: "And if you desire everlasting kingdom, then do justice and remove injustice from the people".

This study aims to show the relevance of justice to discus-sions around the concept of sustainable development, specifi-cally sustainability in management. Our work initially analyzes the concept of justice from western and Islamic perspectives, and secondly reviews discourses of Yusuf in the matter of jus-tice. Lastly, it is attempted to derive concrete implications for sustainable management from Yusuf's approach to justice.

Justice is the foundation of the state and of any institution. Key to the sustainability in management is unconditionally maintaining justice, not being religious. Justice clearly leads to peace, equilibrium, and harmony on earth.

What makes our study significant is our attempt to under-stand this invaluable product of Islamic civilization which has been overlooked by academia. Our effort includes not only in-vestigation of the concept of justice within the framework of Kutadgu Bilig, but also introduction of an alternative approach to the discussions around sustainability in management.

Adam Smith, despite his fame as the founder of modern eco-nomics, interestingly made reference to justice and benevolence as the basic virtues of any decent society (Werhane, 1999). From the point of view highlighted by Guerci et al. (Guerci et al., 2015); sustainability could not be dissociated from ethics. The model developed by Gladwin et al. (1995) discusses equity as a crucial component of sustainability. It basically implies fair distribution of resources and property rights both within and between generations.

For Yusuf, justice is the key of sustainability and does not exclude other living creatures or abiotic environment. More im-portantly, as distinct from equity referring to fair distribution, justice attempts to give everyone his/her due.

This study takes the first step to comprehend the concept of justice as a way of maintaining sustainability in management. Considerably more work will need to be done to determine the practical value of advice texts for sustainability. Various books written in different periods of time could bring us multifarious knowledge and experience.

References

Acındı, Ö. (2006) Siyasetname ve Kutadgu Bilig'te Halk Anlayışı.

Aksan, V. (1993) 'Ottoman Political Writing, 1768-1802', International Journal of Middle East Studies, 25(1), pp. 53–69.

Ali İbn-i EbiTalib (1997) Nehc'ül-Belaga. Edited by A. Gölpınarlı.

Atmaca, V. (2000) 'Hadisleri Bakımından Siyaset (Siyaset ve Siyasetnameler Hakkında Genel Bilgiler)', pp. 357–370.

Bosworth, C. E. (2013) 'Balasaghun', Encyclopaedia of Islam. Available at: http://referenceworks.brillonline.com/entries/encyclopaedia-of-islam-3/balasaghun-COM_23545?s.num=1&s.q=balasaghun#. USolX3JBqFo.mendeley (Accessed: 24 February 2013).

Brundtland, B. (1987) Our Common Future, From One Earth to One World. doi: 10.1080/07488008808408783.

Calhoon, R. P. (1969) 'Niccolo Machiavelli and the Twentieth Century Administrator', The Academy of Management Journal, 12(2), pp. 205–212.

Cho, J. Y. and Lee, E. (2014) 'Reducing Confusion about Grounded Theory and Qualitative Content Analysis : Similarities and Differences', The Qualitative Report, 19, pp. 1–20.

D'Andrade, K. (2012) 'Machiavelli 's Prince as CEO', Business Ethics Quarterly, 3(4), pp. 395–404.

Deverux, R. (1985) 'Wisdom of Royal Glory (Kutadgu Bilig): A Turko-Islamic Mirror for Princes by Yusuf Khass Hajib ; Robert Dankoff', International Journal of Middle East Studies, 17(4), pp. 577–579.

Florea, L., Cheung, Y. H. and Herndon, N. C. (2013) 'For All Good Reasons: Role of Values in Organizational Sustainability', Journal of Business Ethics, 114(3), pp. 393–408. doi: 10.1007/s10551-012-1355-x.

Garavan, T. N. and McGuire, D. (2010) 'Human Resource Development and Society: Human Resource Development's Role

in Embedding Corporate Social Responsibility, Sustainability, and Ethics in Organizations', Advances in Developing Human Resources, 12(5), pp. 487–507.

Gazali (no date) 'Yöneticilere Altın Öğütler'.

Gladwin, T. N., Kennelly, J. J. and Krause, T.-S. (1995) 'Shifting Paradigms for Sustainable Development: Implications for Management Theory and Research', Academy of Management Review, 20(4), pp. 874–907. doi: 10.2307/258959.

Guerci, M. et al. (2015) 'The Impact of Human Resource Management Practices and Corporate Sustainability on Organizational Ethical Climates: An Employee Perspective', Journal of Business Ethics, 126, pp. 325–342. doi: 10.1007/s10551-013-1946-1.

IISD (1992) Business Strategy for Sustainable Development: Leadership and Accountability for the 90s. International Institute for Sustainable Development.

Iqbal, Z. and Lewis, M. K. (2009) An Islamic Perspective on Governance. Edward Elgar.

İbn Teymiye (1999) Siyaset: Es-Siyasetü'ş-Şeriyye. Edited by V. (translated) Akyüz. Dergah Yayinlari.

İyigün, Ö. (2014) 'Corporate Social Responsibility and Ethics in Management in Light of Sustainable Development', in Akküçük, U. (ed.) Handbook of Research on Developing Sustainable Value in Economics, Finance, and Marketing. Business Science Reference, pp. 239–258.

Jonker, J. and Pennink, B. (2010) 'The Essence of Methodology', in The Essence of Research Methodology. Springer-Verlag, pp. 21–41. doi: 10.1007/978-3-540-71659-4.

Keiner, M. (2006) The Future of Sustainability: Re-Thinking Environment and Development in the Twenty-First Century, IUCN Renowned Thinkers Meeting. doi: 10.1007/1-4020-4908-0.

Kriger, M. and Seng, Y. (2005) 'Leadership with Inner Meaning: A Contingency Theory of Leadership Based on the Worldviews of Five Religions', The Leadership Quarterly, 16(5), pp. 771–806. doi: 10.1016/j.leaqua.2005.07.007.

Mahdi, M. S., Rahman, F. and Schimmel, A. (2012) 'Islam', Encyclopedia Britannica Online. Available at: https://univpn.univie.ac.at/+CSCO+0h756767633A2F2F6A6A6A2E6F6576676E616176706E2E70627A++/EBchecked/topic/295507/Islam (Accessed: 14 December 2012).

Nizam al-Mulk (1960) The Book of Government or Rules for Kings - The Siyasat-Nama or Siyar al-Mulk. Edited by H. Darke. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul Ltd.

Papaoikonomou, E. and Seto-Pamies, D. (2016) 'A Multi-level Perspective for the Integration of Ethics , Corporate Social Responsibility and Sustainability (ECSRS) in Management Education', Journal of Business Ethics, 136, pp. 523–538. doi: 10.1007/s10551-014-2535-7.

Pearce, C. L., Waldman, D. A. and Csikszentmihalyi, M. (2006) 'Virtuous Leadership: A Theoretical Model and Research Agenda', Journal of Management, Spirituality & Religion, 3(1–2), pp. 60–77. doi: 10.1080/14766080609518611.

Pomerleau, W. P. (2013) 'Western Theories of Justice', Internet Encyclopedia of Philosophy. Internet Encyclopedia of Philosophy. Available at: http://www.iep.utm.edu/justwest/ (Accessed: 19 July 2013).

Slote, M. (2010) 'Justice as a Virtue', The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy. Fall 2010. Available at: http://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2010/entries/justice-virtue.

Steurer, R. et al. (2005) 'Corporations, Stakeholders and Sustainable Development I: A Theoretical Exploration Relations of Business-Society', Journal of Business ethics, 61(3), pp. 263–281. doi: 10.1007/s10551-005-7054-0.

Syed, M. A. (no date) 'The Idea of the Islamic State', in East-West Connections.

Tyan, E. (2013) ' 'Adl', Encyclopaedia of Islam, Second Edition. Brill Online. Available at: http://referenceworks.brillonline.com/entries/encyclopaedia-of-islam-2/adl-COM_0019.

Walcott, H. F. (1992) 'Posturing in Qualitative Inquiry', in Spindler, G. and Spindler, L. (eds) Cultural Process and Ethnography: An Anthropological Perspective. London: Academic Press. Available at: http://www.scribd.com/doc/6990820/Wolcott-Qualitative-Inquiry (Accessed: 11 January 2013).

Wales, T. (2013) 'Organizational Sustainability: What is it, and Why does it Matter?', Review of Enterprise and Management Studies, 1(1), pp. 38–49.

Werhane, P. H. (1999) A Companion to Business Ethics. Edited by R. E. Frederick. Blackwell Publishers.

Wildemuth, B. M. and Zhang, Y. (2009) Qualitative Analysis of Content. Edited by B. M. Wildemuth. Westport, CT: Libraries Unlimited.

Yusuf Has Hacip (2008) Kutadgu Bilig. 2. Edition, Oriens. 2. Edition. Edited by R. R. Arat. İstanbul: Kabalcı Yayınevi.

Yusūf Khāṣṣ Ḥājib (1983) Wisdom of Royal Glory (Kutadgu Bilig). Edited by R. Dankoff.

Author

Sümeyye Kuşakcı was born in 1983, in Turkey. She completed her undergraduate and graduate studies at Vienna University of Economics and Business Administration. Between the years of 2008 and 2015 she served as an assistant lecturer at Faculty of Economics and Business Administration at International University of Sarajevo. She finished her PhD studies in 2017 at the same university. Nowadays, she is serving as an assistant professor at Ibn Haldun University in İstanbul. She taught various Management courses such as Organizational Behavior, Organizational Leadership, Human Resources Management, Strategic Management, etc. Her research areas are Business Ethics, Leadership, Strategic Management, Human Resources Management, and Consulting. She has good command of English, German and intermediate level of Arabic.

Email: sumeyyearslanoglu@gmail.com